



## Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

*Living with History*

**HPC meeting date: 11/09/2015**  
**Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6**  
**Staff reviewer: Dean Doerrfeld**  
**PTS**

<b>Property</b>	101 West Vine Street Brewer's Hill Historic District	
<b>Owner/Applicant</b>	AMANDA & JERRY TEAGARDNER 220 EAST BROWN STREET MILWAUKEE, WI 53212 PHONE: (414) 690-2050	David J. Koscielniak 12310 West Waterford Avenue Greenfield, WI 53228 Phone: (414) 303-8489
<b>Proposal</b>	This project involves the construction of a gable-roofed, attached, two-car garage and mudroom. Additionally, the reconstruction of the porch at the northeast corner of the dwelling is proposed.	
<b>Staff Comments</b>	<p>The building was constructed ca. 1876 in a vernacular Italianate style with moderate detailing and ornamentation. This building displays select elements of a typical example of this style: moderately-pitched gable roof, arched window openings with brick window hoods, and gouge-work verge board. The primary building material of this two-story, masonry structure is Cream City brick. Dwellings in this area vary in architectural style but have similar scale, massing, and proportions to this ell-shaped structure. The house was occupied originally by Frederick Schloemilch.</p> <p>The Brewer's Hill Historic District was listed in the National Register of Historic Places in 1995, and locally designated in 1985.</p> <p>The applicant proposes to construct a slab-on-grade, gable-roofed garage and connecting mudroom to the west elevation of the existing structure. The overall footprint of the addition measures approximately 30' by 24' feet (the garage area measures roughly 22'x24)', with an approximate ridge height of 15'. The garage will have two, 9'x8' foot wood-faced garage doors facing north. The north wall of the mudroom is flush with the plane of the garage wall and the north wall of the existing projecting bay on the west elevation. The mud/laundry room portion of the addition is approximately 5.5'x24'. The configuration of the interior space of the mudroom calls for the removal of an existing window and the creation of a new door opening, the removal of a wall section at the first level of the western bay, and reducing the height of the second story window. A new porch area will be created on the north side of the addition. This is depicted as a hipped-roof structure with simple, square posts with arched spandrels. A similar design is proposed for the existing porch at the northeast corner. Three wooden brackets will support the eave above the garage doors. Construction materials include Cream City brick for the north wall and weatherboard for the remainder of the structure. No details were provided on doors, windows, or roofing materials.</p> <p>The concept of a two-story, attached garage is not appropriate for the Brewer's Hill Historic District. No other examples exist within this historic district and few are present in any of the City's locally designated historic districts. Where they are found, the garage is appended to a secondary elevation, usually the rear. Visually, the addition more than doubles the width of the structure creating a continuous building wall. The use of Cream City brick on the north elevation intensifies that perception. Other issues are probable with the current proposal, including widening the curb cut and possible utility relocation.</p>	

Staff would recommend that a detached garage located away from and to the rear of the primary dwelling is preferable to an attached structure. This would create a clearly ancillary structure on the property. Building materials, such as all wood, would reinforce the perception of a secondary structure. An additional benefit in this scenario is eliminating the need to widen the curb cut, and the drive could be widened further back in the lot to provide access to both garage bays.

**Recommendation**

Construct attached, two-car garage and mudroom: Disapprove

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC action**

**Previous Council action**