



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 4/14/2025

Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

Ald. Coggs

CCF # 241808

Property 113 W. Lloyd Street

Brewers Hill Historic District

Owner/Applicant MMF Holdings, LLC
5335 W. River Trail Rd.
Mequon, WI 53092

Proposal

The applicants proposed to construct a new three-unit residential property at 113 W. Lloyd Street.

The proposed home is a three-unit, two-and-a-half story, side-gabled residence oriented north towards W. Lloyd Street. Each unit has a two-car garage in the lowest level accessed via a concrete driveway off the alley at the rear of the structure. Each unit is accessed from raised porch. The entry doors will not be visible when looking directly at the structure. The footprint of the main block of the house is 63'-10" wide by 33'-6" deep. Each of the units is a two-bed, two-and-a-half bath with just over 1,350 sq. ft.

Exterior materials proposed consist of 6" LP Smartside engineered wood and engineered wood trim, stamped concrete foundation wall with brick liner texture, dimensional asphalt roof, and a mix of single, paired, and triple double-hung windows of unspecified construction. Windows on the first level will have transoms. No specs have been provided about the garage doors or prime doors.

Staff comments

As new construction in Brewers Hill, there are substantial criteria for evaluation beyond our standard four criteria of siting, scale, form, and materials. The Brewers Hill and Harambee Conservation Overlay District has significant explicit restrictions on building height, roof pitch, porch design, windows, and garage siting. The structure is 38'-3" tall from grade, which meets the 30' minimum height and 40' maximum height. The porch dimensions and raised basement requirements are satisfied. Window orientation, distances, and heights appear to satisfy the requirements on the front façade, though the dimensions need to be verified. Window orientations on the side and rear façades do not appear to satisfy the overlay standards, as they appear too far apart. The overlay requires the roof pitch of between 8:12 and 12:12. The primary roof pitch is 8:12, while the pitch on dormers is 14:12.

Criteria

1. Siting

The siting appears to be addressed adequately. Between the base zoning and the overlay, traditional siting is effectively required at the baseline. The arrangement of the house and driveway eliminate any rear yard. The only available greenspace is the approximately four feet on either side of the structure or the front 5'-5" located in the right of way.

2. Scale

The guidelines specifically refer to the "bulk" of the building. The footprint of the structure is large, nearly 2,150 sq. ft., including the attached garage. The height of the house is 38'-3" from grade and additional 2' taller from the rear grade. While large, the structure is within the scale of other properties in Brewers Hill.

3. Form

"The massing of new construction must be compatible with surrounding buildings." Most of the properties in the adjacent area are front gabled or gable ell houses. The proposed property is a side-gabled house with the alignment of the house parallel to the street rather than perpendicular. Given the lot size and shape, this is the only orientation that works if the applicant proposes a footprint this large.

4. Materials

Siding, Windows, and Doors

The house is proposed to be clad with 6" LP Smartside engineered wood and engineered wood trim. HPC has never approved an engineered wood material such as LP Smartside. HPC has allowed fiber cement siding in smooth finish for new construction of residential structure and garages. Furthermore, the smooth finish version of Smartside appears to have been discontinued. Staff recommends a smooth finish fiber cement siding or wood clapboard with a 6" or less exposure. The front porches, steps, and decking are proposed to be constructed out of wood.

The window and doors are unspecified. The mix of single, paired, and triple double-hung windows with single fixed windows is distracting and staff recommends picking simplified module for windows. Four-over-four windows are not an arrangement found in Brewers Hill and staff recommends either one-over-one or six-over-one windows with simulated divided lights constructed of wood, wood-clad, or fiberglass. Staff is willing to approve specific models later in the process if the Commission applies certain conditions to what can be approved. Doors should be solid wood or wood veneer. Garage overhead doors can be insulated steel door with non-faux woodgrain. Staff recommends windows be added to the garage door. A stamped concrete brick pattern has been approved by HPC in the past for foundations. Staff recommends the pattern continue for the rear façade rather than the switch to siding.

Garage

The zoning overlay states that garages "must be located in the rear yard and must use the alley for access if available." This is technically achieved, but the Commission has generally interpreted this to require a detached garage where it is feasible. Given the size constraints of the parcel and siting of the house, a detached garage is not feasible.

Recommendation

Recommend HOLD for further modifications.

Staff recommendations:

1. Exterior siding to be untreated wood clapboard or smooth fiber-cement lap siding with a 6" or less exposure.
2. Exterior trim and fascia to be constructed of natural wood
3. Windows to be all-wood, non-clad windows. Windows to be one-over-one or 6-over-one windows with simulated divided lights.
4. Addition of windows on side and rear facades to meet requirement that windows are spaced no more than 8 feet apart.
5. Addition of basement windows on the front and side facades
6. Addition of windows on garage doors
7. Addition of a larger window in the two attic gable ends
8. Roof shingle to be plain, non-staggered with minimal shadow line. Certain architectural shingles meet this standard.
9. HVAC equipment to be installed at the rear façade.
10. Continuation of stamped brick concrete for the rear façade
11. No glass block windows in basement.

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action