



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/6/2025

Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

CCF #250827

Ald. Brower

Property	2105 E. Lafayette Pl.	North Point South Historic District
Owner/Applicant	Ashley & Michael Adam 2105 E. Lafayette Pl. Milwaukee, WI 53202	

Proposal

The applicants are seeking to replace an existing French door and paired casement transom window on the rear façade of the property with a single-light, non-French door and single-light transom window. They are proposing to use a Marvin aluminum-clad product.

Staff comments

The Andrew A. Hathaway House is a grand Queen Anne style residence designed by Howland Russell and constructed in 1887. The door and transom light proposed to be replaced are on the rear (south) façade and located in a bedroom that leads to a balcony. The doors are set in a polygonal projecting bay. The projecting bay has centered French doors flanked by two vertical fixed windows. Each window/door has a square casement transom window. Photos provided by the applicants show significant deterioration to the bottom of the French doors. The existing doors have double-glazed windows and appear to be replacement doors of unknown vintage.

The preservation guidelines for windows and doors in North Point South state to:

Retain the original configurations of panes, sash, lintels, keystones, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods, doors, shutters and hardware. Avoid making additional openings or changes in the principal elevations by enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit new stock window sash or new stock door panes or sash. Avoid discarding original doors and door hardware when they can be repaired or reused.

Respect the stylistic period or periods a building represents. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the appearance and design of the original window sash or door. Avoid using inappropriate sash and door replacements such as unpainted galvanized aluminum storm and screen window combinations.

Staff agrees that the French doors are deteriorated and in need of replacement. Per the preservation guidelines for the district, staff recommends that new doors French doors matching the profile of the existing French doors are installed. The cohesion of the vertical orientation of the projecting bay would be lost by using a single door rather than French doors and by eliminating the casement transom windows. Staff also recommends an all-wood replacement door, rather than an aluminum clad product. The applicants are concerned with water splashing up from the balcony causing deterioration to the wood doors. Historic photos of the rear balcony show an out-swinging storm door was previously installed at the French doors. Staff strongly recommends a new storm door be installed to help with energy efficiency and protecting the prime doors. From the photos provided, there does not appear to be any deterioration to the transom windows that would necessitate replacement. Staff recommends the existing transom windows above the doors remain and wood storm windows be installed, if desired.

Recommendation	Recommend denial of the aluminum clad single-light door and transom window.
-----------------------	---

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action