



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/13/2016
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Carlen Hatala
PTS #113430

Property 2214 N. TERRACE AV. North Point South Historic District

Owner/Applicant T. ARTHUR DOWNEY & RHONDA Lakeside Development Company
M DOWNEY RESIDUARY TRUST 1500 N. Market Street Suite 200
2214 N TERRACE AVE Mequon, WI 53092
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 Attn: Todd Rabidoux

Proposal The house at 2214 N. Terrace Avenue was built between 1860 and 1865 and is the oldest extant house on Terrace Avenue. The area was first subdivided by Glidden & Lockwood in 1854. H. Russell Zimmermann explains the complicated history of the early years in his Milwaukee Journal article "Years Brought Changes" on March 26, 1972. The original house was a 2 1/2 story, towered Italianate villa that included a prominent east wing.

It was after long-term owners, the James C. Ricketsons (1874-1902), sold the house to Herman W. Falk that changes were made to the house in 1902, 1915, and 1945 that brought the house to its present appearance. The 1902 remodeling was designed by Alexander Eschweiler. The 1915 remodeling was designed by Fitzhugh Scott. The 1945 alteration added an elevator.

The new owner in 1949, Julian Sammet, converted the house into a duplex and constructed the 3-car garage. A later owner Charles W. Aring acquired the house in 1959. Other owners have included Peter Bahnzaf, Prudence Perry and Virginia Little.

The new owners propose to address long deferred maintenance and repair and replace select features of the house, install some new windows, enlarge some windows and a doorway and convert the property back into single family use.

Staff comments

The proposal is best understood by breaking it down into specific projects.

ROOFING

Rubber roofs will be installed over the south angle bay, the 7-sided east wing bay roof, and the quarter-round Lake Room. The original east wing (dating to 1860-1865) has a gabled roof and this will remain. The built-in gutters at these locations will be retained and lined with copper. Drip edges for the roofs will be trimmed out in copper as well as the flashings where the rubber membrane meets the masonry walls. All downspouts will be replaced with rectangular copper downspouts. Painted galvanize flashing is located around the bottom of the parapet wall where it meets the roof over the cornice. It will be repaired or replaced with a heavy gauge prefinished white aluminum.

MASONRY

Cracks above two basement windows in the Lake Room will be repaired by removing brick and repairing the metal lintel and resetting the brick.

The brick exterior will be pressure washed and areas of repointing will be identified. Holes left by the removal of through-the-wall A/C units and ventilation holes will be filled in with reclaimed Cream City Brick.

The front porch's quarry tile surface will be pressure washed and re-pointed and re-caulked as needed to stop leaking into the basement below. Drains will be cleaned and two new drains will be added to the north porch wall.

The sill below one of the north entry doors is fractured and will be replaced with a Bedford limestone sill.

WINDOWS

Front Elevation—The original one-over-one double hung wood windows will be retained and restored. Three second floor wood storms will be replaced with wood. Third floor wood storms will be replaced with Marvin wood combination storms/screens for easier maintenance.

South Elevation—The same treatment will be taken on this elevation. One second story single lite window to the right of the bay will be replaced with a wood double hung.

North Elevation—The same treatment will be taken on this elevation for the three-story portion of the house. At the projecting north entry, a single light window will remain. At the projecting east wing, original to the house, the existing box bay will remain but the wood windows, now blocked with plywood, will be replaced with aluminum-clad, fixed casement windows.

East elevation—The east elevation currently consists of a variety of windows and materials. It is proposed to replace all of these windows with Marvin Magnum aluminum clad wood windows to bring the fenestration into conformity.

East elevation attic--Starting at the attic level, the three metal casement windows will be replaced with clad double hung windows that will be lengthened to terminate below the cornice line. To the right the current double hung window now serving a bathroom will be replaced with two double hung clad windows, likewise lengthened. The single light attic window facing north will be replaced with a clad double hung window.

East Elevation Second Story--On the second story the single light modern door will be replaced by single light French doors of clad wood. Two windows will replace the short single window to the right of the new French doors. They will be taller than the original window and line up with the height of the French doors. To the right of these windows will be a new, arched top clad double hung window.

East Elevation Polygonal Bay—This bay was added in 1915. The current windows consist of single lite windows on the second story and windows with transoms on the first. The proposal is to replace these with clad wood windows that feature multi-paned transoms.

East Elevation Lake Room—The current fenestration consists of wood windows with 6-light transoms. The banks of windows are grouped into threes divided by wooden Ionic columns. The proposal is to replace the windows with metal clad windows.

METAL

The ornamental metal cornice will be cleaned and repaired as needed. The new upper railing on the Lake Room will consist of simple metal pickets that generally resemble what had been on the roof.

WOOD TRIM / WOOD

Wood trim around windows will be cleaned and repainted. Doors will be retained and repaired and painted

PAINTING

After cleaning the exterior brick walls, the applicant proposes to use an elastomeric coating on the exterior.

MECHANICALS

Mechanicals will be located on the roof and one condenser will be located on the roof of the north entrance.

GARAGE

The garage will have a new roof, the exterior will be repainted, 2 light fixtures will be replaced on the west façade, and new wood garage doors will be installed. Approve majority of proposal.

Recommendation

The HPC has not approved metal clad windows on historic buildings, just wood windows, even on elevations not visible from the street. The HPC has approved clad windows once, on a new infill house in North Point South. Applicant is making the case that the current windows on the east elevation are a mix of various types and materials, including aluminum. The owner wishes to have less maintenance at this side of the house. This elevation is not seen from the street. While this elevation is not part of the original 1860-1865

Staff has concerns about the use of elastomeric coating for the house. From literature read, it is designed to keep moisture out but a house needs to breathe, especially cream city brick. Staff did not find anything about how such a coating could be removed. In preservation all work should be reversible.

Conditions

Only the gentlest pressure washing is acceptable to avoid pitting and damaging masonry and metal.

Elastomeric paint is not allowed by the SHPO. It does not appear to be reversible.

It is not clear from the photos provided whether or not the transoms have leaded glass. If they do have leaded glass, they would have to be re-installed in any replacement window.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action