



# Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

**HPC meeting date: 10/14/2019**  
**Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3**  
**Staff reviewer: Dean Doerrfeld**  
**PTS #114854**

**Property** 2017 N. TERRACE AV.

**Owner/Applicant** SHUTTER HOUSE LLC James & Maura Otzko  
2235 E WOODSTOCK PL  
MILWAUKEE WI 53202 Phone: (239) 898-7415

**Proposal** The applicant is seeking retroactive approval for the re-siding of the second level of the home. The previous condition, cedar siding with mitered corners, was replaced by the applicants with hardie plank siding and corner boards.

**Staff comments** The use of hardie plank siding has never been approved by this commission in an historic district. The composite material does not meet the guidelines for rehabilitation, which call for the avoidance of materials that are "inappropriate or were unavailable when the building was constructed." The appearance and lifespan of hardie plank do not hold up against cedar siding. The hardie plank is extremely thin and embossed with a wood grain in a way that is more similar to vinyl siding than wood. Cedar siding is tapered and smooth, giving it a much different appearance.

The appearance of the property also changed significantly with the removal of mitered corners. The home now has hardie plank corner boards. Per the guidelines for this district, the removal of architectural features is strongly advised against. Mitered corners are a distinct design element and are an "essential part" of this building's overall character. Pattern books from the 1920s and 1930s show "garrison colonials" like this one with mitered corners and it was a standard feature of the style.

By the stated reasons, Staff finds the removal and replacement of cedar siding with hardie plank siding is not permitted and must be reversed. The siding must also be returned to its original condition with mitered corners.

**Recommendation** Recommend HPC Denial

**Conditions**

**Previous HPC action**

**Previous Council action**