



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 8/4/2025
Staff reviewer: Andrew Stern

CCF #250498
Ald. Bauman

Property	3033 W. Kilbourn Ave.	Concordia Historic District
Owner/Applicant	James & Rebekah Nicholas 3033 W. Kilbourn Ave. Milwaukee, WI 53208	

Proposal

The applicants are seeking to rehabilitate the carriage house at the rear of their property. The exterior scope of work that pertains to this request includes removal of the rear dormer, a new asphalt shingles to match existing, repair/spot replacement of siding, and restoration of shingle siding where it had been removed on the east and west façades.

Staff comments

The Marie and Ernst Pommer House is a grand German Renaissance Revival style residence designed by Schnetzky & Liebert and constructed in 1895. No building permit was located for the carriage house but it likely dates to near the date of construction for the residence and it is contributing to the National Register district. Due to neglect and termite damage, the building is structurally compromised. The owners have contracted a structural engineer to reinforce the structure.

In addition to the exterior work, extensive interior structural work will also be taking place. That work includes support structures on the second floor, removal and replacement of the concrete foundation, new footings, reinforcement of the walls on the south façade, new electrical and new plumbing. The structural engineer determined that removal of the dormer on the south roofline would relieve weight and allow for needed work to the ridge line of the roof. The dormer does not face the right of way and is not visible from the street. A paired door in the gable would also be removed with the gable and would be infilled with siding to match existing. The roof would be rebuilt and shingled to match existing.

The preservation guidelines for roofs in Concordia state to:

Retain the original roof shape.... Avoid making changes to the roof shape that would alter the building height, roofline, pitch or gable orientation.

The preservation guidelines for wood finishes in Concordia state to:

Retain original material, whenever possible. Avoid removing architectural features such as half-timbering, window architraves and doorway pediments. These are in most cases an essential part of a building's character and appearance that should be retained.

Repair or replace deteriorated material with new material that duplicates the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Avoid covering architectural features with new materials that are inappropriate or were unavailable when the building was constructed such as artificial stone, brick veneer, asbestos or asphalt shingles, vinyl or aluminum siding.

While losing the dormer is unfortunate, it appears to be the best option to retain the structural integrity of the rest of the carriage house. The dormer is not visible from the right of way and removal of the dormer will not be detrimental to the building, overall.

The drop siding and shingle cladding on the carriage house are deteriorated and largely do not appear to be salvageable. Replacement in-kind with wood drop siding and shingles to duplicate the appearance of the original siding is supported by the preservation guidelines. Staff has not received specs for the overhead doors, personnel

doors, or windows from the applicant. Staff recommends the applicants work with staff to find appropriate replacements, where applicable. The project has been reviewed and approved by the Wisconsin Historical Society as part of a Historic Homeowner's Tax Credit application.

Recommendation

Recommend approval with conditions:

Conditions

1. All finish wood must be smooth and free of knots and must be painted or treated with an opaque stain upon completion. Note: when new, bare wood is left exposed to the exterior elements for a period of only a week or two, the life the of the paint job subsequently applied to it will be decreased. The use of a decay-resistant wood for is required for porch areas. Using western white pine or Ponderosa pine is "at your own risk" because this wood has no natural decay resistance and can deteriorate in some exterior settings in just a few years.
2. No chimneys, moldings parapets, or other permanent features will be altered or removed. No box vents, if used, will be visible from the street. If they are installed, they must be on a rear slope not visible from the street and they must be painted to blend with the color of the roofing material. A continuous ridge vent can be installed in place of box vents, but the vent must extend across the entire ridge and not stop short. Built-in rain gutters will be retained and patched where needed. Valleys must be metal W-shape with no interweaving of shingles. Valleys and flashing must be painted or factory-finished to match the roofing color, unless copper. When installing new flashing at a masonry feature, the flashing must be stepped or cut into the mortar joints. The bricks may not be cut to install flashing at an angle.

We strongly recommend that that the Wisconsin Historical Society's best practices for re-roofing with composition shingles be used to extend the life of your new roof. (Synthetic underlayment is an acceptable alternative to 30lb felt.) <https://www.wisconsinhistory.org/Records/Article/CS4260>

3. Work with staff on finding replacement overhead doors, doors, and windows, where applicable.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action