



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report—Corrected

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 10/1/2018
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114615 CCF #180807

Property 114 W. LLOYD ST. Brewers Hill HD

Owner/Applicant Amanda Betts, purchaser, for: David Koscielniak
GBH 2037 LLC
802 N 109TH ST Phone: (414) 303-8489
MILWAUKEE WI 53226

Proposal Construct new 1.5 car garage at rear of lot with overhead door facing the alley. The garage is L-shaped to address fire separation and pedestrian path issues created by the small lot. The size is roughly 20' x 20' with a 26'1" roof height and 14/12 roof pitch.

Parking patio, 10' wide, immediately south of the garage. No materials are noted.

Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal, 6" corner boards, and textured shakes in the gable peak. Trim mimics the house using simple 1x4 planks at the change in floor levels.

Staff comments

The design strongly references the house on the lot in its detailing between the floor levels. While this detailing needs a few more pieces to echo the house more thoroughly. The concept needs only minimal alterations that involve additional stock lumber trim pieces (approx. 15 pieces). The roof has an unusually steep pitch (14/12), but most of the gables on the house appear similarly steep and it is therefore acceptable.

Smartside does not manufacture a smooth-textured shingle and offers only the artificially grained shake. This detail would have to be completed in wood to meet the commission's standards. Smartside and Hardie do not offer a smooth texture option.

Overhead doors should have a wood appearance/veneer because of street visibility. Flexibility in materials can be considered for the service door because of the need for a fire-rated assembly. The design proposed is acceptable and wood is preferred, but steel or fiberglass could be considered if necessary for fire rating.

Siding is proposed as LP Smartside with a 4" reveal. It is an engineered wood product of chips, glues, and resins first introduced in 1990 and reformulated under the current name in 1997 after a class action lawsuit regarding longevity of the earlier product (InnerSeal). The product is maintenance heavy and difficult to install correctly due to the requirement that no portion of the wood material is rated for environmental exposure. All nail holes and cut edges must be caulked and painted to prevent rot and water damage. Installation must be done very carefully. Staff opposes the use of this material.

The Commission has a strong history of requiring wood siding when a garage has significant visibility. While this garage is not directly on the street, it will be highly visible through the yard from the public sidewalk.

The parcel is approximately 2931 sq. ft. The garage has a 384 sq. ft. footprint. It meets maximum lot coverage requirements [Calculation error in previous version]

Recommendation

Recommend HPC Approval

Conditions

1. All trim to be natural wood. All windows to be natural wood.
2. No shakes, must use smooth sawn shingles with even coursing, may be same product line as material approved below by Commission.
3. If not using ridge vent, box/pan vents must be only on the north slope of the roof.
4. Parking patio must be concrete or permeable pavers.

Materials option in preferred order:

- A. All wood exterior because of strong street visibility.
- B. Smooth cement board siding (with wood trim and shingles)
- C. LP Smartside in smooth texture (with wood trim and shingles)

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action