



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 11/4/2019
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114869 CCF #191018

Property	116 W. VINE ST.	Brewers Hill
Owner/Applicant	Kevin Baumgart/Allison Scrivner 2013 N Booth ST MILWAUKEE WI 53212	Gabor Design/Build Bryan Wick

Proposal The applicants propose to construct a new home at 116 W. Vine St. The commission previously approved the demolition of a garage at the rear of this site. The site is now completely vacant.

The proposed home is 2.5 stories and has an attached garage that will be accessible via the public alley along the west property line. The home will be oriented facing South toward Vine street.

The entrance to the home is on the front (South) elevation at the southwest side of the facade. It features an elevated wooden front porch with an iron railing covered by a second story balcony that also features an iron railing. The wooden porch steps and decking will be painted and feature the required vertical skirting. The foundation of the home at the front facade is clad in Lannon stone. It features two large egress window wells with double hung windows. At the first and a half story of the front elevation, the home is clad with a field of cream city brick. A central bay with a pair of double hung windows at the first and second level is clad with LP Lap siding. All of the windows throughout the home will be aluminum-clad, double hung wood windows that will be trimmed with painted cedar boards. The windows in the field of brick will be framed with rowlock sills and soldier coursing at the head. The upper half of the second story of the home is clad with LP Smartside horizontal lap siding with cedar trim and custom cedar gable vents. Three double hung windows are centered in the gable below the gable vent.

At the East elevation, the 1.5 story field of cream city brick wraps around the home halfway. The Lannon stone at the foundation also wraps around the home halfway along the East elevation. At this point, the entire home is clad in LP Lap Siding with cedar trim. At the foundation, the material changes from Lannon stone to concrete that will be brick textured and colored to resemble cream city brick.

At the West elevation, the foundation will be entirely brick textured concrete that will be colored to resemble cream city brick. From this elevation, the home is clad in LP Lap siding except for the recessed porch entrance which features cream city brick that wraps around from the front (south) elevation. The garage is attached by a small breezeway that gives the appearance of a detached garage from Vine street. The garage is also front-gabled. The roof of the garage and the home utilize a 12/12 pitch, asphalt shingles, and prefinished aluminum K-style gutters.

From the North elevation of the garage, the facade is fairly plain and features LP Lap siding and a painted entry door. At the North elevation of the home, there is a single double hung window at each level of the home (3 total). From this elevation, the home and the garage both feature concrete foundation with brick texture colored to match cream city brick.

Staff comments

Guidelines for new construction in the Brewer's Hill Historic District address the siting, scale, form, and materials of the proposed structure. Additional design guidelines regarding the Harambee and Brewer's Hill Conservation Overlay District. Staff's analysis of the proposed home weighs the design against these standards. The home incorporates details from Eastlake, Shingle, and Queen Anne styles while with a mixture of historic and contemporary materials.

Siting

This is generally met with the only major concern being the attached garage. The required "traditional siting" includes "the relationship between the main building and accessory buildings. Lot coverage is significantly lower than the allowed maximum (50% v. 70%).

Scale

- Most front facing windows satisfy overlay district standards and are a minimum 5.5' in height (overlay).
- Gable windows are appropriate, but 4' double hung at the second level does not comply. In order to retain a smaller window, the applicant must substitute the double hung window for a specialty window. Staff would suggest a multipane fixed or hopper window.
- Recessed front porch with upper balcony is conceptually compatible; however the design and materials do not comply with overlay district standards or with the porches of surrounding properties.
- Expression of the foundation, body, and roof is present but the scale emphasizes horizontality rather than verticality.
- Roof pitch at 12:12 is appropriate and complies with overlay district standards; however the sense of verticality afforded by the steep pitch of the roof is lost in the application of materials and width of the home. The width of the house needs to be narrowed under the roof width
- Recessed third story and shingling at the front façade along with eaves that are too shallow, create a "hat on box" appearance. The home appears too wide.
- Side trim boards on windows and doors are too wide.
- Garage is nearly the same footprint as the main house. Some of the storage space could be incorporated into the house's third floor with cross gables
- Garage should be narrowed. A double garage door would be preferred and would assist with narrowing the garage.

Form

The home is more square in plan (35'-8" x 32'-8") compared to other homes in the district which are generally more elongated and rectangular in plan. It appears too wide from the front elevation. The garage is sited at the rear and is accessed through the alley which complies with the overlay district standards. An attached garage is not typical; however the siting and reduced scale of the adjoining space can give the illusion of a detached garage from areas along Vine St.

- Central bay does not project a significant amount and therefore appears to be awkwardly massed. The bay is situated centrally on the body of the home and beneath the gable rather than centrally sited within the region between the porch and the eastern edge of the home. This gives the home an uneven appearance.
- Visual balance in the late Victorian styles relies on thirds or fifths, but on not three or five sections. For thirds, massing is broken into 1/3 width section and a 2/3 width section (1:2 ratio or 2:1:2 ratio).
- Vertical massing could be emphasized with a subordinate gable on the front. This could cover the porch or everything but the porch.

Materials

Multiple materials clad the home:

- The cream city brick utilized at the front facade clads only 1.5 stories of the home. This proportion contributes to the home's squat appearance.
- Brick treatment at the windows - trimming the windows with flanking columns of headers is atypical.
- Per Commission precedent for all historic districts, use of LP Lap siding has never been permitted. The profile, texture, and appearance of synthetic siding are not compatible with historic districts. Staff and Commission members have also expressed deep concern about the longevity of the material.
- Decking and skirting materials used at the porch (painted wood) are appropriate. However, an iron railing could not be made compatible with the overlay district standards which require that handrails be a min. 3" in height and bottom rails be a min. 1.5" in height.
- While lannon stone is an appropriate material, its use at the foundation on the front facade introduces a third material to the primary elevation. Lannon stone at foundation level (in Brewer's Hill) is typically more monumental in scale (compare 1951 N. 2nd St).
- Material change on the East elevation at the foundation and the body is awkward, contributes to truncated and squat appearance of the home.
- The front door, as presented, has a Craftsman appearance. Victorian doors have more complex moldings and different glass patterns (or no glass pattern).
- The applicant is to be complimented on incorporating details from the shingle style, such as the way in which the third story is recessed. However, staff is concerned about allowing asphalt shingles as part of an architectural detail on the primary façade.

Recommendation

Hold for revisions.

Conditions

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action