



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 9/13/2021
Ald. Nik Kovac District: 3
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #115188 CCF #210673

Property 2449 N. DOWNER AV.

Owner/Applicant *MILWAUKEE PROTESTANT HOME FOR THE AGED* Eastcastle Place
2505 E BRADFORD AV 2505 E. Bradford Ave
MILWAUKEE WI 53211 Milwaukee, WI

Proposal

1. Enclosed wheelchair ramp in new single-story addition
2. Add balconies to southernmost building
3. Replace windows with new fiberglass windows

Staff comments Approval criteria for additions to the Protestant Home are minimal. "Approval shall be based upon the addition's design compatibility with the building in terms of height, roof configuration, fenestration, scale, design and materials, and the degree to which it visually intrudes upon all elevations"

Visual intrusion is minimal because of the location. The other criteria are less clearly met. Materials are modern, but certainly compatible in color and arguably in texture. The main material is a synthetic stone panel. A simple revision giving the addition a clear cornice and differentiated base may be enough to make the design compatible with the overall campus and particularly the historic structure.

The balconies are a modest and minor alteration that are in character with the original design of this wing. They were previously unnecessary due to the particulars of the tenancy in this wing. The post-renovation plan will have occupants that can take advantage of the balconies. It is arguable that balconies improve the overall appearance and they should be approved as proposed.

Original windows for this wing appear to have been metal-clad wood. Records of our approval in 1999-2000 indicate a requirement for wood. The architects at the time may have misinterpreted this. As replacement is now proposed, there is no need for enforcement action. Unfortunately, 20 years is about the expected lifespan of a modern clad window. Applicant proposes a Pella fiberglass window. HPC should take the opportunity to go back to its original design requirements and require true wood again.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Require differentiated cornice and base
2. Non-clad, all wood windows.

Previous HPC action

Previous Council action