



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date: 6/14/2021
Ald. Milele Coggs District: 6
Staff reviewer: Tim Askin
PTS #114912 CCF #210173

Property	217 W. RESERVOIR AV.	Brewers Hill
Owner/Applicant	SUZANNE GREINERT JAMISON KLINKNER 217 W RESERVOIR AV MILWAUKEE WI 53212	Mr. Dave J Koz Koz-i-tec-ture 12310 W Waterford Ave Greenfield, WI 53228
Proposal	Construct rear addition with attached garage, two gable dormers on west elevation and one shed dormer on the east elevation. Project will also permanently seal two west elevation windows. Proposal creates usable second floor space and a needed parking space.	
Staff comments	<p>This project has been through two Commission meetings. In March 2020, three options were presented for conceptual approval and two options were approved, pending some design refinements and additional information. This proposal is a substantially unchanged version of one of the two approved concepts. A massing model and sections are provided this time for clarity.</p> <p>All rejected proposals featured flat-roofed attached garages. The attached garage with living space above was considered based strictly on unusual conditions at this site.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Sharing an alley with King Drive presents unique parking challenges for a property with no onsite parking.2 With tight property lines, setback rules, and fire separation requirements, a detached garage is physically impossible on this site. <p>As usual, the six zoning overlay criteria for Brewers Hill alterations are applicable. Items 1, 3, & 4, height, raised basement, and front porches are irrelevant as no changes affecting those are proposed.</p> <p>Criterion 2, roof pitch, requires expansions to match the existing roof pitch, this is met.</p> <p>Criterion 5 addresses windows. The only concern here is that there appear to be at least two locations where windows are more than 8' apart or are lacking in a stretch of 8' horizontal feet. This occurs in several places on the secondary elevations.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The west elevation dormer can easily be remedied with a small, fixed window in the closet. This is a common feature of pre-electric house design and would be appropriate here. The new windows in the prior addition should be placed closer together. One stud bay each should suffice to achieve symmetry and meet the zoning requirement.2. On the east elevation, the new northmost window could be a made into a real window with real shutters.3. On the south, the windows could be moved slightly closer together or a third window added. This change may affect the floorplan and is on the rear elevation and is above the neighbor's garage. Staff does not feel that changing the windows in this location is vital.	

**Staff comments
(cont.)**

HPC Guidelines:

1. Siting. Substantially in character, footprint expansion is in line to the rear, it is offset from the south end. The attached garage is unusual but is allowed per prior conceptual approval based on unique site conditions.
2. Scale: The scale of the home is maintained, although closer window spacing in some locations would help. This criterion can be met with subtle alterations.
3. Form. Form is in character. If the garage were living space rather than a garage, this addition would likely be approved without question.
4. Materials. Materials have some open questions. Real wood siding has been traditionally required for all uses in Brewers Hill. No engineered products have been allowed.

Recommendation Recommend HPC Approval with conditions

Conditions

1. Appropriate all-wood, non-clad windows to be submitted for staff approval prior to permitting.
2. Siding and trim to be real wood, not engineered substitutes
3. Exterior doors should be solid wood or wood veneer.
4. Add fixed window to shed dormer closet.
5. Consider closing spacing of ground floor east windows
6. Consider real window at north end of east floor ground level.
7. 6. Submit any revised drawings to staff for approval, requested changes are minor.

**Previous HPC
action**

181839, May 2019 dormer addition and fenestration changes. Not granted. Recommended to pursue an addition at the rear as an alternate.

191654, March 2020, conceptual presentation of three options. Two of the options were recommended for further design refinement.

**Previous Council
action**