



Milwaukee Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report

LIVING WITH HISTORY

HPC meeting date	5/13/2024	CCF # 240057
Ald. Stamper	Staff reviewer: Tim Askin	
Property	2525 N Grant Boulevard	Grant Boulevard HD
Owner/Applicant	Laura Dauenhauer	

Proposal

The applicant's presumably original slate roof has reached its lifespan. Due to an exponential difference in costs, the applicant proposes an asphalt shingle replacement for both house and garage. Siding on dormers will be replaced with cedar shingles. Copper gutters will be retained on the house, but replaced with aluminum with a bronze-colored finish on the garage.

Staff comments

Multiple well known roofing contractors have visited to evaluate for various bids and types of repair. All bids provided to us were for complete replacement. Per prior advice from former WHS staff, I suggested a change from the original proposal for an ordinary dimensional shingle. WHS prefers GAF Slateline as essentially the only acceptable asphalt for replacing slate. As the Commission has generally not found synthetic slates to be acceptable, this is the best option.

The bid for in-kind replacement was \$644,000. The asphalt shingle roof and cedar shingle siding option is \$50,000. The price difference makes the choice for the main roof obvious.

There are a few smaller points to consider in the project. The last time the HPC dealt with this issue was at a Concordia property and the owner was required to maintain the slate siding on the dormers. The dormer slate in this case shows significant color variation, but in no discernible pattern. Thus it may be important to keep as the asphalt shingle has significantly less color variation. With the large area of the roof, there should be enough salvageable material to repair the dormer siding. The garage roof is noticeably less deteriorated than the house roof and may have more salvageable material.

The garage gutters are currently copper and proposed for replacement with aluminum in a bronze finish. They are admittedly in abominable condition and unlikely to be repairable. Considering staff's recommendation to require retention of the ridge caps, a verdigris finish may be preferable, but aluminum is certainly allowable on a garage, if the molding design is an adequate match. The gutter profile appears to be slightly unusual. An exact match is not required if a mass market product is sufficiently close, but comparison will be necessary. Therefore the molding design of the proposed replacement gutter should be shown to staff for approval and comparison.

Recommendation

Approve with conditions.

Conditions

1. Copper ridge caps shall be retained and reused or replicated in kind. This also applies to the garage.
2. Match gutter profile on garage as closely as possible.
3. Require slate be used for dormer sides